



**Ohio Attorney General's Office**  
**Bureau of Criminal Investigation**  
Investigative Report



2022-2918

Officer Involved Critical Incident - 500 West Hopocan, Barberton, OH  
44203

**Investigative Activity:** Firearm Lab Report Received and Reviewed  
**Involves:** [REDACTED] (S)  
**Activity Date:** 1/31/2023  
**Activity Location:** BCI – Richfield, 4055 Highlander Parkway, Ohio 44286  
**Authoring Agent:** SA Nicholas Valente

**Narrative:**

On January 18, 2023, Ohio Bureau of Criminal Investigation (BCI) Special Agent (SA) Charles Moran received an Ohio BCI Laboratory report for evidence items submitted on January 10, 2023 (laboratory report number 23-30232). The report originated from the Firearms section of the laboratory and was authored by Forensic Scientist Joshua Barr. The items relevant to this report, which had previously been submitted, were:

1. Smith and Wesson M&P .45 caliber pistol bearing serial number [REDACTED] belonging to Officer [REDACTED] (Matrix Item #9 / Crime Scene Item #9).
2. One fired .45 caliber cartridge casing recovered from the scene of the shooting (Matrix Item #6 / Crime Scene Item #6).

SA Nick Valente reviewed the analysis report and learned the firearm noted above was determined to be operable. Furthermore, the firearm noted above was responsible for firing the cartridge casing listed above.

A copy of the laboratory report and lab analyst's statement of qualifications was attached to this report.

**Attachments:**

1. 2023-01-18: Firearm Lab Report
2. 2023-01-18: Firearm Lab Analyst Statement of Qualifications



# DAVE YOST

OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

Bureau of Criminal Investigation

Laboratory Report  
Firearms

To: Ohio Attorney General's Office  
Nick Valente  
30 E. Broad Street  
Columbus, OH 43215

BCI Laboratory Number: 23-30232

Analysis Date:  
January 10, 2023

Issue Date:  
January 12, 2023

Agency Case Number: 2022-2918  
BCI Agent: Charles Moran

Offense: Shooting

Subject(s):

Victim(s):

**Submitted on January 10, 2023 by Nick Valente:**

- One box containing Herbert Shield's firearm S/N/: [REDACTED]  
*-One (1) Smith & Wesson 45 Auto semi-automatic pistol, model M&P45, serial number [REDACTED] three (3) magazines and thirty (30) 45 Auto cartridges.*
- Envelope containing casing recovered from the scene  
*-One (1) fired 45 Auto cartridge case.*

**Findings**

Item Description	Comparison	Conclusion
Item #1 – Smith & Wesson pistol	N/A	Operable
	Item #2 – cartridge case	Source Identification

**Remarks**

Two (2) of the submitted cartridges were used for testing.

Test fired specimens from law enforcement firearms are not entered into the NIBIN database.

No pertinent findings were made with respect to the additional magazines from Item #1.

Please address inquiries to the office indicated, using the BCI case number.

BCI -Bowling Green Office  
750 North College Drive  
Bowling Green, OH 43402  
Phone:(419)353-5603

BCI -London Office  
1560 St Rt 56 SW P.O. Box 365  
London, OH 43140  
Phone:(740)845-2000

BCI -Richfield Office  
4055 Highlander Pkwy. Suite A  
Richfield, OH 44286  
Phone:(330)659-4600

All evidence will be returned to the submitting agency.

**Analytical Detail**

Analytical findings offered above were determined using visual and microscopic examinations / comparisons.



Joshua Barr  
Forensic Scientist  
(234) 400-3649  
joshua.barr@OhioAGO.gov



Based on scientific analyses performed, this report contains opinions and interpretations by the analyst whose signature appears above. Examination documentation and any demonstrative data supporting laboratory conclusions are maintained by BCI and will be made available for review upon request.

Your feedback is important to us! Please complete our Laboratory Satisfaction Survey at: <https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/O9VOHL5>

### Comparison Conclusion Scale

The following lists the conclusions a Forensic Scientist may reach when performing comparisons. In reaching a conclusion, a Forensic Scientist considers the similarities and dissimilarities and assesses the relative support of the observations under the following two propositions: the evidence originated from the same source or from a different source.

A Forensic Scientist may utilize their knowledge, training, and experience to evaluate how much support the observed similarities or dissimilarities provide for one conclusion over another. A conclusion shall not be communicated with absolute certainty. It is an interpretation of observations made by the Forensic Scientists and shall be expressed as an expert opinion.

1	Source Identification	The observations provide extremely strong support for the proposition that the evidence originated from the same source and the likelihood for the proposition that the evidence arose from a different source is so remote as to be considered a practical impossibility.
2	Support for Same Source	The observations provide more support for the proposition that the evidence originated from the same source rather than different sources; however, there is insufficient support for a Source Identification. The degree of support may range from limited to strong or similar descriptors of the degree of support. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
3	Inconclusive	The observations do not provide a sufficient degree of support for one proposition over the other. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
4	Support for Different Source	The observations provide more support for the proposition that the evidence originated from different sources rather than the same source; however, there is insufficient support for a Source Exclusion. The degree of support may range from limited to strong or similar descriptors of the degree of support. Any use of this conclusion shall include a statement of the factor(s) limiting a stronger conclusion.
5	Source Exclusion	The observations provide extremely strong support for the proposition that the evidence originated from a different source and the likelihood for the proposition that the evidence arose from the same source is so remote as to be considered a practical impossibility; or the evidence exhibits fundamentally different characteristics

We invite you to direct your questions to:  
Abby Schwaderer, Quality Assurance Manager  
(740) 845-2517  
[abby.schwaderer@ohioattorneygeneral.gov](mailto:abby.schwaderer@ohioattorneygeneral.gov)

**Joshua B. Barr**

Ohio Bureau of Criminal Identification and Investigation  
Statement of Qualifications  
Richfield, OH 44641  
(234) 400-3649  
Joshua.barr@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

---

**Education**      **Bachelor's Degree – Forensic Science;** Eastern Kentucky University; 2007

**Professional Experience**      **Ohio Bureau of Criminal Identification and Investigation**  
January 2009 – Present; Forensic Scientist – Firearms Section

**Hamilton County Coroner's Office**  
March 2008 – December 2008; Forensic Scientist I – Firearms Section

**Specialized Training**      **Association of Firearm & Toolmark Examiners Annual Training Seminar**  
May 2014; Seattle, WA

**Ammunition Workshop**  
May 2014; George Kass; Seattle, WA

**Advanced Topics in Firearm and Toolmark Identification Workshop**  
February 2014; Ron Nichols; BATF – Cleveland, OH

**Ethics Training**  
December 2013; Ohio Attorney General's Office; BCI – Richfield

**2012 SHOT Show**  
January 2012; Sands Convention Center; Las Vegas, NV

**Ethics Training**  
December 2011; Ohio Attorney General's Office; OPOTA – Richfield

**Ithaca Gun Company Factory Tour**  
December 2011; Upper Sandusky, OH

**Beginning Courtroom Testimony**  
December 2010; Ohio Fire Marshalls Training Academy – Reynoldsburg, OH

**Colt 1911 Armorer's Course**  
November 2010; OPOTA – London

**Smith & Wesson M&P Pistol Armorer's Course**  
February 2010; BCI&I – Richfield

**Sig Sauer Pistol Armorer's Course**  
September 2009; BCI&I – Richfield

**Gun Shot Residue Distance Determination**  
September 2009; BCI&I – London, MFRC; Jack Dillon

**Is It a Bullet Hole?**  
June 2009; AFTE 2009; Miami, FL; Lucian Haag

**Taurus Factory Tour**  
June 2009; AFTE 2009; Miami Gardens, FL

**Full-Auto Conversion Course**

June 2009; AFTE 2009 & BATF&E; Miami, FL

**Association of Firearm & Toolmark Examiners Annual Training Seminar**

June 2009; AFTE 2009; Miami, FL

**Colt AR-15 Armorer's Course**

April 2009; BCI&I – Richfield

**Ethics in Forensic Science**

March 2009; Online through WVU

**Serial Number Restoration Training**

September 2008; Hamilton County Coroner's Office/ Forest Park PD; Forest Park, OH

**Glock Factory Tour**

June 2008; Hamilton County Coroner's Office; Smyrna, GA

**Hi-Point Factory Tour**

May 2008; Hamilton County Coroner's Office; Mansfield, OH

**National Integrated Ballistic Information Network (NIBIN) Training**

April 2008; Hamilton County Coroner's Office & BATF&E; Largo, FL

**Memberships**

**Association of Firearm and Toolmark Examiners (AFTE)**

Provisional Member #2811; December 31, 2010

**Association of Firearm and Toolmark Examiners (AFTE)**

Regular Member; June 29, 2015

**Honors and Awards**

**Ohio Bureau of Criminal Identification and Investigation Unit Award – Firearms Section**

December 2009; BCI&I - London, OH