# RECEIVED

MAY 1 4 1999

CLERK OF COURTS U.S. DISTRICT COURT, N.D.O. CLEVELAND

# 99 JUL -7 PH 3:25

CLERK U. S. DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF GHIO AKRON

9CV1153\*

JUDGE DAVID D. DOWD, JR.

# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO EASTERN DIVISION

:

:

:

:

1.B

STATE OF OHIO, ex rel. BETTY D. MONTGOMERY ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OHIO,

Plaintiff,

v.

at

GENCORP, INC., et al.,

Defendants.

#### **CONSENT DECREE**

Plaintiff, State of Ohio, ex rel. Betty D. Montgomery, Attorney General of Ohio, has filed the Complaint in this action against Defendants for reimbursement of response costs incurred by the State pursuant to the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980 as amended, 42 U.S.C. §9601 et seq. ("CERCLA") and Ohio Revised Code ("R.C.") Chapter 3745.

NOW, THEREFORE, without trial and upon the consent of the parties hereto, it is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED and DECREED as follows:

#### DEFINITIONS

Whenever the following terms are used in this Consent Decree, the following definitions

shall apply:

- A. "Consent Decree" means this Decree.
- B. "Hazardous substance" shall have the meaning provided in Section 101(14) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §9601(14).
- C. "National Contingency Plan" shall be used as that term is used in Section 105 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §9605.
- D. "Ohio EPA" means the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency, its Director, and its designated representatives.
- E. "Response Costs" means all direct and indirect costs incurred by the State of Ohio related to the response and remedial actions conducted at the Fields Brook Site by the Settling Defendants, other PRPs, U.S. EPA, and Ohio EPA, including, but not limited to, payroll costs, contractor costs, travel costs, oversight costs, laboratory costs, costs of reviewing or developing plans, report or other items, and costs of the Ohio Attorney Generals Office in representing Ohio EPA in this action.
- F. "Settling Defendants" means GenCorp, Inc., Millennium Inorganic Chemicals, Inc.; Consolidated Rail Corporation; The Sherwin-Williams Company; Union Carbide Corporation, Detrex Corporation; Viacom International Inc.; RMI Titanium Company; Occidental Chemical Corporation; Cabot Corporation; Ohio Power Company; Olin Corporation; FirstEnergy Corporation; ASHTA Chemicals, Inc.; Bee Jay Construction Co., Inc.; C.H. Heist Corp.; Elkem Metals Company, L.P.; Greenleaf Motor Express, Inc.; The Koski Construction Company; Luntz Services Corporation; Mallinckrodt, Inc.; Millennium Petrochemicals, Inc.; Motta's Body and Frame Shop, Inc.; Plasticolors, Inc.; and Reserve Environmental Services, Inc.
- G. "Settling Federal Agencies" means the General Services Administration (as successor to the Defense Plant Corporation) and the Department of Energy.
- H. "Site" or "Fields Brook Site" shall mean, solely for the purposes of this Consent Decree, the Fields Brook, with its surrounding watershed and tributaries that is located in or near Ashtabula, Ohio, and as specifically shown on the map attached as Appendix A.

- I. "State" means the State of Ohio by and through its Attorney General on behalf of the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency.
- J. "U.S. EPA" means the United States Environmental Protection Agency,

#### BACKGROUND

1. The United States Environmental Protection Agency ("U.S. EPA"), pursuant to Section 105 of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980 ("CERCLA"), 42 U.S.C. § 9605, placed the Fields Brook Site in Ashtabula County in Ohio on the National Priorities List, which is set forth at 40 C.F.R. Part 300, Appendix B, by publication in the Federal Register on September 8, 1983, 48 Fed. Reg. 40658.

2. In response to a release or a substantial threat of a release of hazardous substances at or from the Site, U.S. EPA has performed a Remedial Investigation and Feasibility Study ("RI/FS") for the Site.

3. Upon completion of the RI/FS, U.S. EPA selected a remedial action embodied in a Sediment Operable Unit Record of Decision ("SOU ROD"), executed on September 30, 1986.

4. After issuing the SOU ROD, U.S. EPA issued, pursuant to Section 106 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9606, an administrative order (EPA Docket No. V-W-89-C-008) and entered into an administrative order by consent (EPA Docket No. V-W-89-C-026) requiring certain Settling Defendants and certain other PRPs to perform the design of the remedy selected in the SOU ROD and to implement a second phase Source Control Unit RI/FS ("SCU RI/FS").

5. In designing the SOU remedy, Settling Defendants also were required to conduct studies concerning contamination of the floodplain and wetlands at the Site adjacent to the Fields Brook and its tributaries, and upon completion of those studies, U.S. EPA selected another

3

remedial action to be implemented at such areas at the Site, and that remedial action is embodied in a Floodplain and Wetlands Operable Unit record of Decision ("FWA ROD"), executed on June 30, 1997.

6. The Settling Defendants completed the SCU RI/FS in May, 1997, and U.S. EPA selected a remedial action embodied in a SCU Record of Decision ("SCU ROD"), executed on September 29, 1997.

7. On December 17, 1997, U.S. EPA issued another administrative order to the Settling Defendants to design and implement the FWA ROD remedy and to implement the SOU ROD remedy as amended by an Explanation of Significant Differences ("ESD").

8. In response to further studies performed in 1988, on April 8, 1999, U.S. EPA issued another Explanation of Significant Differences ("Site Wide ESD") from the SOU ROD, the FWA ROD, and the SCU.

9. The State has incurred costs in addressing releases or the substantial threat of releases of hazardous substances at and from the Site.

10. Settling Defendants have consented to the entry of this Consent Decree without acknowledging liability of any type, and the entry of this Decree shall not represent an admission or adjudication of liability.

11. The Parties agree, and the Court by entering this Consent Decree finds, that entry of this Consent Decree is in the public interest and will avoid prolonged and complicated litigation between the Parties.

#### **JURISDICTION**

12. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter herein, and over the Parties consenting hereto. The Settling Defendants and Settling Federal Agencies shall not challenge this Court's jurisdiction to enter and enforce this Consent Decree. The Settling Defendants and Settling Federal Agencies waive service of the complaint and summons in this action.

#### PARTIES BOUND

13. This Consent Decree applies to and is binding upon the Settling Defendants and Settling Federal Agencies their successors in interest, assigns, receivers, officers, agents, servants, and employees. The undersigned representative of each party to this Consent Decree certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the party or parties whom she or he represents to enter into the terms and conditions of the Consent Decree and to execute and legally bind that party to it.

#### REIMBURSEMENT

14.a. No later than thirty (30) calendar days after entry of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendants shall pay to the State One Hundred Sixty-Eight Thousand, Three Hundred Dollars (\$168,300.00) in settlement of all claims the State has against the Settling Defendants for Response Costs incurred by the State prior to the entry of this Consent Decree.

14.b.i. Within a reasonable time, the United States, on behalf of the Settling Federal Agencies, shall pay to the State Eleven Thousand, Nine Hundred, Twelve Dollars (\$11,912.00) in settlement of all claims the State has against the Settling Federal Agencies for Response Costs incurred by the State prior to the entry of this Consent Decree.

ii. In the event that payments required by Paragraph 15.b. are not made within 120 days of the effective date of this Consent Decree, interest shall be paid on the unpaid balance at the rate specified by section 107 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607. The interest to be paid under this Paragraph shall begin to accrue on the 121st day following the effective date of this Consent Decree and shall accrue through the date of payment.

iii. The Parties agree that in any judicial proceeding to enforce the monetary terms of this Consent Decree, the Settling Federal Agencies may raise as a defense their obligation to comply with the Anti-Deficiency Act, 31 U.S.C. § 1341, or any other applicable provision of law. While the State disagrees that such defenses exist, the Parties agree that it is premature at this time to raise and adjudicate the existence of such defenses.

15. The payments made pursuant to Paragraphs 14.a. and 14.b. above shall be made in the form of a certified or cashier's check or a Treasury check payable to "Treasurer, State of Ohio" and sent to the Fiscal Officer, Ohio EPA, P.O. Box 1049, 122 South Front St., Lazarus Government Center, Columbus, Ohio 43215, ATTN: Edith Long, or her successor. Settling Defendants and Settling Federal Agencies shall send a copy of the transmittal letter and copy of the check to: the Fiscal Officer, DERR, Ohio EPA, P.O. Box 1049, 122 South Front St., Lazarus Government Center, Columbus, Ohio 43215, ATTN: Patricia Campbell or her successor, to the Ohio EPA Site Coordinator, and the Assistant Attorney General representing the State in this case.

6

I

#### **COVENANT NOT TO SUE**

16. In consideration of the payments made by Settling Defendants and Settling Federal Agencies pursuant to Paragraphs 14.a. and 14.b. above, the State covenants not to sue or take administrative action against Settling Defendants and Settling Federal Agencies or their officers, directors, employees, successors or agents pursuant to Section 107(a) of CERCLA and R.C. Section 3745.12 for any Response Costs related to the Site which were incurred by the State prior to the entry of this Consent Decree. Such covenant not to sue is effective for the Settling Defendants and Settling Federal Agencies upon payment of their separate payment obligations. For purposes of this paragraph, areas outside the Site, include, but are not limited to, the Ashtabula River and Lake Erie even though those areas may have been contaminated or may be contaminated by some areas within the Site.

#### STATE RESERVATION OF RIGHTS

17. The State reserves, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, any other State claim. The Settling Defendants and Settling Federal Agencies reserve their defenses to any such claim.

18. Nothing in this Consent Decree shall constitute or be construed as a release or a covenant not to sue regarding any claim or cause of action against any person, firm, trust, joint venture, partnership, corporation or other entity not a signatory to this Consent Decree for any liability it may have arising out of or relating to the Site, including but not limited to, liability for any Response Costs unreimbursed by this Consent Decree. The State expressly reserves the right to sue any person other than Settling Defendants and Settling Federal Agencies, in connection with the Site.

#### **CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION**

19. This Consent Decree provides Settling Defendants and Settling Federal Agencies with contribution protection for the Response Costs incurred by the State prior to the entry of the Consent Decree as provided in Section 113(f) of the Superfund Amendments and Reauthorization Act of 1986.

#### DISCLAIMER OF LIABILITY

20. This Consent Decree shall not constitute an admission or adjudication with respect to any allegation in the State's Complaint, or any admission of any wrongdoing or misconduct or liability on part of Settling Federal Agencies and Settling Defendants or their officers, directors, employees, successors or agents.

#### <u>COSTS</u>

21. Settling Defendants and Settling Federal Agencies shall pay the costs of this action. These costs do not include the \$150 filing fee for the State's Complaint. Such fee has been added to the past response costs and is being paid pursuant to paragraphs 14.a. and 14.b. of this Decree.

Entered this 7 day of Nwy 1999.

HONÓRABLE JUDGE DAVID D. DOWD, JR. United States District Judge

The Parties whose signature appear below and on the attached signature pages hereby consent to the terms of this Consent Decree in the matter of <u>State of Ohio v. GenCorp. Inc., et al.</u>

## BETTY D. MONTGOMERY ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OHIO

TIMOTHY J/KERN (0034629) Assistant Attorney General Environmental Enforcement Section 30 East Broad Street, 25th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215-3428 (614) 466-2766 JOSEPH LONARDO VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE 1828 L Street NW, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor Washington, D.C. 20036-5109

Attorney for Settling Defendants

The Parties whose signature appear below and on the attached signature pages hereby consent to the terms of this Consent Decree in the matter of <u>State of Ohio v. GenCorp. Inc., et al.</u>

LOIS J. SCHIFFER Assistant Attorney General Environment and Natural Resources Division

Lewis M Barr <u>\_S</u>JW

LEWIS M. BARR Environmental Defense Section Environment and Natural Resources Division U.S. Department of Justice P.O. Box 23968 L'Enfant Plaza Station Washington, D.C. 20026-3986 (202) 514-4206

4

Attorney for Settling Federal Agencies

The Parties whose signature appear below and on the attached signature pages hereby consent to the terms of this Consent Decree in the matter of <u>State of Ohio v. GenCorp, Inc., et al.</u>

1

## BETTY D. MONTGOMERY ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OHIO

TIMOTHY J. KERN (0034629) Assistant Attorney General Environmental Enforcement Section 30 East Broad Street, 25th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215-3428 (614) 466-2766

# LOIS J. SCHIFFER Assistant Attorney General Environment and Natural Resources Division

LEWIS M. BARR Environmental Defense Section Environment and Natural Resources Division U.S. Department of Justice P.O. Box 23968 L'Enfant Plaza Station Washington, D.C. 20026-3986 (202) 514-4206

Attorney for Settling Federal Agencies

Longido

GOSEPH LONARDO VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE 1828 L Street NW, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor Washington, D.C. 20036-5109

Attorney for Settling Defendants

:.

GenCorp Inc. 175 Ghent Rd. Fairlawn, OH 44333-3300

By:

;

ins m WG. Jr.

Chris W. Conley Director, Environmental Health & Safety GenCorp Inc.

5/11/99

1

r<sup>à</sup>

Millennim Inorganic Chemicals Inc.

Name of Defendant

200 International Circle Suite 5000 Hunt Valley, MD 21030

Address

By: Signature of Representative

Samuel Friedman

Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Vice President

Title

April 26, 1999

Date

i

, s

CONSOLIDATED RAIL CORPORATION Name of Defendant

2001 Market Street 16-A Pwo Commerce Square Philadelphia, PA 19103

Address

By: Signature of Representative

Thomas P. Pendergast Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Senior Director-Superfund Sites Environmental Quality Department

Title

<u>ر</u>،

-99 ~ 3 Date

4

jà.

.....

# The Sherwin-Williams Company Name of Defendant

101 Prospect Avenue, N.W. Cleveland, Ohio 44115 (216) 566-2000

Address

By: 57 Signature of Representative

Louis E. Stellato

Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Vice-President, General Counsel & Secretary

Title

April 27, 1999

 $\frac{1}{2}$ 

#### UNION CARBIDE CORPORATION

# Name of Defendant

39 Old Ridgebury Road Danbury, CT 06817-0001

Address

245 By: Signature of Representative

J.C. Hovious

# Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Director, Environment

Title

May 4, 1999

Detrex Corporation

24901 Northwestern Highway, Suite 500 Address Southfield, MI 48075

me By:

Signature of Representative

Robert M. Currie Name of Representative (Print or Type)

<u>General Counsel & Sec</u>retary Title

April 26, 1999 Date

Viacom International Inc. Name of Defendant

1515 Broadway New York, NY 10036

Address

By: Signature of Representative

Mark C. Morril Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Vice President and Deputy General Counsel Title

May 3, 1999

.

RMI TITANIUM COMPANY Name of Defendant

1000 WARREN AVENUE NILES, OHIO 44446

Address

By:

Signature of Representative

TIMOTHY G. RUPERT Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Executive Vice President & Chief Financial Officer

Title

May 6, 1999

:.

ø

Occidental Chemical Corporation 5005 LBJ Freeway Dallas, TX 75244

۰.

By:

Keith McDole Senior Vice President and General Counsel

(999 Date

Cabot Corporation Name of Defendant

75 State Street Boston, MA 02109

Address

By: Signature of Representative

Robert Rothberg

Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Vice President and General Counsel Title

April 29, 1999

Ohio Power Company

Name of Defendant

'301 Cleveland Ave. S.W. Canton, Ohio 44701

Address

•

By: of Representative perman President

ce

John F. DiLorenzo

Name of Representative (Print or Type) For Service and Correspondence Vice President American Electric Power Service Corporation 1 Riverside Plaza Columbus, OH 43215

Title

J.

April 27, 1999 Date

្លុំន

Olin Corporation
Name of Defendant

501 Merritt 7 P.O. Box 4500 Norwalk, CT 06856-4500

Address

US.

By: Signature of Representative

Curt M. Richards

Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Corporate Director, Environment Health and Safety

Title

99

Date.

÷ 1

ł

FirstEnergy Corp.

Name of Defendant

76 S. Main Street Akron, OH 44308

Address

÷

٩.

⊭ 1 \_ )

By: Signature of Representative

Douglas J. Weber

Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Attorney

Title

May 11, 1999 Date

1

ASHTA Chemicals Inc. Name of Defendant

P.O. Box 858 Ashtabula, OH 44005-0858

Address

ed R. Bauter By:

Signature of Representative

Reginald R. Baxter Name of Representative (Print or Type)

CEO

Title

May 3, 1999

<u>BEE JAY CONSTRUCTION CO., INC. (F/K/A BRENKUS EXCAVATING, INC.)</u> Name of Defendant

759 EAST 15TH STREET, ASHTABULA, OHIO 44004 Address

km By:

Signature of Representative

ĩ

 BEN
 BRENKUS

 Name of Representative (Print or Type)

PRESIDENT

Title

#### C.H. Heist Corp.

Name of Defendant

810 North Belcher Road Clearwater, Florida 33765

Address

By:

Signature of Representative

John L. Rowley

Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Vice President-Finance

Title

May H, 1999

ELKEM METALS COMPANY L.P. Name of Defendant

P.O. Box 266 Pittsburgh, PA 15230-0266

Address

By: Signature of Representa

Francis A. King Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Vice President & General Counsel Title

1999 29 Date

<u>Greenleef</u> Motor Express. Inc. Name of Defendant

:4606 state Road Ashtabula, 0/6 44004 Address

Signature of Representative By:

Name of Representative (Print or Type)

President Title

.,

<u>April 25 1999</u> Date

.

а<sup>н</sup> -

Koski Construction Company, Inc. Name of Defendant

5841 Woodman Ave. Ashtabula, OH 44004 Address

By:

Signature of Representative

Donald R. Koski Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Vice President Title

April 28, 1999 Date

Luntz Services Corporation Successor in Interest to Luntz Corporation Name of Defendant

2351 Raintree St. N.E. Canton, OH 44705

Address

oyul. By: Signature of Representative

Gregory W. Lintz Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Vice President, Secretary & Treasurer Title

April 29, 1999

Luntz Services Corporation . Successor in Interest to Luntz Corporation Name of Defendant

2351: Raintree St.N.B. Canton, OH 44705 Address

By:

<u>Will</u> G. Will, Eg. Signature of Representative Buckingen Poolittle & Barrough

William G. Williams

Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Attorney at Law Title

April 29, 1999

. . .

MALLINCKRODT INC.

Name of Defendant

675 McDonnell Blvd. Hazelwood, MO 63042

Address

By: Signature of Representative

Roger A. Keller

Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Vice President, General Counsel & Secretary

Title

ay 4, 1999 Date

Millennium Petrochemicals Inc. Name of Defendant

' 11500 Northlake Drive \_\_\_\_\_Cincinnati, OH\_\_\_45249 Address

By:

Signature of Representative

Charles F. Daly

Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Vice President & CFO

Title

Date

• ) ;

1

4

MOTTA'S BODY & FRAME SHOP, INC.

#### Name of Defendant

3949 North Ridge East Ashtabula, OH 44004

Address

;

By:

Signature of Representative

Timothy J. Motta Name of Representative (Print or Type)

President Title

1-29-99

Date

4.

Plasticolors, Inc.

2600 Michigan Avenue Ashtabula, OH 44004

Address

ſ

By: Stephen J. Walling

Stephen J. WALLING Name of Representative (Type or Print)

CEO PRESIDENT Title

Date

<u>\_</u>-

Reserve Environmental Services, Inc. Name of Defendant

4633 Middle Rd. Ashtabula, OH 44005 Address

By: re of Representative

Yogi V. Chokshi Name of Representative (Print or Type)

Vice President Title

April 28, 1999

