IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS CUYAHOGA COUNTY, OHIO

STATE OF OHIO, ex rel.	: CASE NO. 2010 CV 726172
MICHAEL DEWINE	:
OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL	: JUDGE DANIEL GAUL
Plaintiff,	: :
v.	OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL'S OFFICE
F&S SATKA ENTERPRISES, LLC.,	GENERAL'S OFFICE
And	FFR 21 2012
SAKO SATKA	TOLEDO
Defendants.	: :

CONSENT ORDER AND FINAL JUDGMENT ENTRY

WHEREAS, Plaintiff, the State of Ohio, on relation of its Attorney General, at the written request of the Director of Environmental Protection, filed a Complaint seeking injunctive relief and civil penalties from Defendants F&S Satka Enterprises, LLC and Sako Satka (collectively "Defendants") for violations of Revised Code ("R.C.") Chapter 3704 and the rules promulgated thereunder;

WHEREAS, Plaintiff and Defendants (the "Parties") have consented to the entry of this Consent Order;

Therefore, without the trial, admission, or determination of any issue of fact or law, and upon the consent of the parties hereto, it is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED, and DECREED as follows:

I. DEFINITIONS

 "Complaint" refers to the State of Ohio's Complaint filed against Defendants in the Cuyahoga County Common Pleas Court on May 10, 2010.

- 2. "Defendants" mean, collectively, (1) F&S Satka Enterprises, and (2) Sako Satka.
- 3. "Director" means the Director of the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency.
- "Facility" is defined in Ohio Adm.Code 3745-20-01(B)(18) and is used herein to refer to Defendants' operations at 1020 Bolivar Avenue in Cleveland, Cuyahoga County, Ohio.
- 5. "Ohio EPA" means the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency.
- 6. "Order" refers to this Consent Order.
- 7. "Plaintiff" means the State of Ohio.
- 8. All other terms not specifically defined herein, are defined, to the extent applicable, in accordance with the definitions provided in R.C. Chapter 3704 and Ohio Adm.Code Chapter 3745-20.

II. JURISDICTION AND VENUE

9. The Court has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of this case. The Complaint states a claim for which relief can be granted under R.C. Chapter 3704. Venue is proper in this Court for the purposes and duration of this Order.

III. PERSONS BOUND

10. The provisions of this Consent Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Parties to this action in accordance with Rule 65(D) of the Ohio Rules of Civil Procedure, their officers, agents, servants, employees, attorneys, successors, and assigns, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Consent Order whether by personal service or otherwise.

IV. SATISFACTION OF LAWSUIT AND RESERVATION OF RIGHTS

11. Plaintiff alleges in its Complaint that Defendants conducted a demolition operation at the Facility in such a manner as to result in violations of the air pollution control laws and

regulations of the State of Ohio. Completion of the terms of this Consent Order shall constitute full satisfaction and release of any civil and administrative liability of Defendants to Plaintiff for the claims alleged in Plaintiff's Complaint up to the date of the Court's entry of this Order.

12. This Order shall not be construed to limit the authority of Plaintiff to seek relief for violations not alleged in the Complaint, nor shall this Order bar the State of Ohio from bringing any action against Defendants for any violation(s) that occur after the entry of this Order. Nothing in this Order shall be construed to relieve Defendants of his/its obligation to comply with applicable federal, state or local statutes, regulations, or ordinances.

V. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

- 13. Defendants agree not to perform any asbestos abatement or removal.
- 14. Prior to conducting any renovation or demolition operation, Defendants agree to ensure that an asbestos survey has been performed by an Ohio Certified Asbestos Hazardous Evaluation Specialist.
- 15. Prior to commencing any demolition or renovation operation, Defendants agree to ensure that an Ohio Certified Asbestos Removal Contractor has fully removed and/or abated, in compliance with Ohio Adm.Code Chapter 3745-20, any regulated asbestos containing material identified by the required asbestos survey.

VI. CIVIL PENALTY

16. The applicable Ohio EPA calculated penalty is one hundred twenty-eight thousand and five hundred dollars (\$128,500) for the violations here at issue. Defendants have objected to the calculation of the Ohio EPA. In light of Defendants' financial condition, the Parties have agreed to a stipulated civil penalty as follows:

- a. Pursuant to and in accordance with R.C. 3704.06, Defendants are enjoined and ordered to pay within sixty (60) days of the entry of this consent order a penalty of twenty-five thousand dollars (\$25,000). In the event of non-payment within sixty (60) days, the amount of the penalty shall increase to thirty thousand dollars (\$30,000).
- b. Satka Parking Enterprises, LLC, a non-party, shall execute and grant to the State a mortgage against the condominium first floor unit at 1020 Bolivar Avenue, Cleveland, Ohio, in the amount of thirty thousand dollars (\$30,000), subject to satisfaction of such mortgage amount by payment of the penalty in paragraph 16.a. This mortgage shall not include any property owned by 1020 Bolivar, LLC.
- c. The remainder of the calculated civil penalty has been waived by the Ohio EPA under the terms of this Agreement provided that the Defendants y comply with the injunctive relief contained herein and pay all moneys due and payable. Provided, however, nothing herein shall limit the Ohio EPA from addressing its waiver and release of the foregoing amount of its calculated civil penalty in the event that Defendants violate any terms of this agreement.
- 17. The foregoing stipulated sum penalty shall be paid as follows:
 - a. Defendants shall, within sixty (60) days of entry of this Consent Order, fund a supplemental environmental project ("SEP") by making a contribution in the amount of twenty (20) percent five thousand dollars (\$5,000.00)– of the total civil penalty to Ohio EPA's Clean Diesel School Bus Program Fund (Fund 5CD0). Defendants shall tender a certified check payable to the order of "Treasurer, State of Ohio" for five thousand dollars (\$5,000.00). The certified check shall specify that such monies be deposited in Fund 5CD0 established by Ohio EPA for the Clean Diesel School Bus Program. The certified check, together with a letter identifying Defendants, shall be

delivered to Martha Sexton or her successor, Paralegal, Office of the Attorney General of Ohio, Environmental Enforcement Section, 30 East Broad Street, 25th Floor, Columbus, Ohio 43215-3400. The memorandum portion of the check, or some other prominent location on the transmittal letter or documentation, shall include a reference to "Satka, A.G. EAGO No. 329896."

b. Defendants shall pay the remaining eighty (80) percent – twenty thousand dollars (\$20,000.00) – of the total civil penalty by certified check payable to the order of "Treasurer, State of Ohio" and delivered within sixty (60) days of entry of this Consent Order to Martha Sexton or her successor, Paralegal, Office of the Attorney General of Ohio, Environmental Enforcement Section, 30 East Broad Street, 25th Floor, Columbus, Ohio 43215-3400. The memorandum portion of the check, or some other prominent location on the transmittal letter or documentation, shall include a reference to "Satka, A.G. EAGO No. 329896."

VII. STIPULATED PENALTIES

- 18. In the event that Defendants fail to comply with any requirement or deadline contained in this Order or any requirement or deadline contained in any document approved in accordance with this Order, Defendants are jointly and severally liable for and shall on their own accord pay additional stipulated penalties without demand or notice by the State of Ohio in accordance with the following schedule for each failure to comply:
 - a. For each day of each failure to comply with any requirement or deadline of this Order up to and including the first thirty (30) days of each failure, five hundred dollars (\$500.00) per day for each requirement or deadline not met.
 - b. For each day of each failure to comply with a requirement or deadline of this Order for days thirty-one (31) to sixty (60) days of each failure, seven hundred fifty dollars (\$750.00) per day for each requirement or deadline not met.

- c. For each day of each failure to comply with a requirement or deadline of this Order for each day over sixty (60) days of each failure, one thousand dollars (\$1,000.00) per day for each requirement or deadline not met.
- 19. Any payment required to be made under the provisions of Section VII of this Order shall be made by delivering to Plaintiff, c/o Martha Sexton or her successor at the Office of the Attorney General of Ohio, Environmental Enforcement Section, 30 East Broad Street, 25th Floor, Columbus, Ohio 43215-3400, a certified check, or checks, made payable to the order of "Treasurer, State of Ohio" for the appropriate amount within thirty (30) days from the date of the failure to meet the requirement or deadline of this Order. The payment of the stipulated penalty shall be accompanied by a letter briefly describing the type of violation, deadline, or requirement not met and the date upon which the violation of this Order occurred. The memo portion of the check, or some other prominent location on the transmittal letter or documentation, shall include a reference to "Satka, A.G. EAGO No. 329896."
- 20. The imposition, payment of stipulated penalties by Defendants and the acceptance of such stipulated penalties by Plaintiff pursuant to this Section shall not be construed to limit Plaintiff's authority to seek similar remedies, civil, criminal or administrative, for violations of applicable laws in the event of Defendants subsequently violating applicable environmental laws. Nor shall Plaintiff be restricted from seeking judicial enforcement of this Order for similar or other environmental violation for which a stipulated penalty was paid. <u>VIII.</u>

RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

21. The Court will retain jurisdiction of this action for purposes of enforcing this Consent Order.

IX. COURT COSTS

22. Defendants are hereby ordered to pay all court costs of this action.

X. ENTRY OF CONSENT ORDER AND JUDGMENT BY CLERK

23. Pursuant to Rule 58 of the Ohio Rules of Civil Procedure, upon signing of this Consent Order by the Court, the clerk is directed to enter it upon the journal. Within three (3) days of entering the judgment upon the journal, the clerk is directed to serve upon all parties' notice of the judgment and its date of entry upon the journal in the manner prescribed by Rule 5(B) of the Ohio Rules of Civil Procedure and note the service in the appearance docket.

XI. AUTHORITY TO ENTER INTO THE CONSENT ORDER

24. The undersigned represent and warrant that he/she understands the terms and conditions of this Order and certify that he/she is fully authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this Order and to execute and legally bind each Defendant to this document.

IT IS SO ORDERED: DANIEL GAUL	w
APPROVED: F&S SATKA ENTERPRISES	, LLC
By: Spiko Satka	

MICHAEL DEWINE OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

Wednesday M. Spelles

SAMUEL PETERSON (0081432) Assistant Attorney General

MANA Its SAKO SATKA and for Satka Parking Sako Satka, individuall

Sako Satka, individually and for Satka Parking Enterprises, LLC

85 Public Square, Suite \$\$24950 Cleveland, OH44113

JOSEPH B. JEROME

Notary Public-State of Ohio My Commission Has No Expiration Date

Section 147.03 RC

Environmental Enforcement Section 30 East Broad Street, 25th Floor Columbus, OH 43215

WEDNESDAY M. SZOLLOSI (0075655)

Assistant Attorney General Environmental Enforcement Section One Governmental Center, Suite 1240 Toledo, Ohio 43604 *Attorneys for the Plaintiff, State of Ohio*

FEB 1 6 2012